

Persian translation of this paper entitled:  
روایتگری عناصر فرمی سینمای بلاتار از دیرند برگسون  
is also published in this issue of journal.

## Original Research Article

# A Narration of Bergson's Duration by Formal Elements of Bela Tarr's Cinema\*

Mohammad Reza Faqih Habibi<sup>1</sup>, Ali Sheikh Mehdi<sup>2\*\*</sup>, Maryam Bakhtiarian<sup>3</sup>

1. Ph.D. Candidate of Philosophy of Art, Department of Law, Theology, Political Science, Science and Research Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran.

2. Associate Professor of Animation and Cinema Group, Department of Art, Tarbiat Modares University, Tehran, Iran.

3. Assistant Professor of Philosophy of Art Group, Department of Law, Theology, Political Science, Science and Research Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran.

Received: 05/07/2024 ;

accepted: 12/11/2024;

availableonline:21/12/2024

## Abstract

**Problem statement:** Bergson's Duration is adding a qualitative aspect to the perception of time and in fact, removing the quantitative aspect and space of time. This view of Bergson prompted Deleuze to show a narration from Bergson's Duration from classical cinema to modern cinema in two books, "Cinema 1" and "Cinema 2", with a historical look at cinema as an image of modern man. He shows how classical cinema indirectly and modern cinema directly can do this narration. He did not make a distinction between form and content elements in explaining how this narration is happening. The article tries to evaluate this narration by separating all cinematic formal elements from each other and only emphasizing formal elements in Bela Tarr's cinema.

**Research objective:** The article seeks to reach the possibility and manner of narrating time as a Duration through the formal elements of Bela Tarr's cinema.

**Research method:** After explaining Bergson's theory with Deleuze's interpretation of it, which was made using library sources, and after seeing all the Bela Tarr's works, the article isolated (Epoche) all the formal elements of his cinema from other formal elements with a phenomenological method, and the effect each of these elements has been measured on the narration of Duration.

**Conclusion:** The article shows that Bela Tarr's cinema has the ability to narrate Bergson's Duration due to its purely formal elements. These formal elements are two categories: structural and non-structural. The non-structural formal elements in Bela Tarr's cinema activate Artistic devices that in the first step, provide a foundation for the narration of Duration, and in the next step, due to the existence of the Boredom Artistic device and non-structural formal elements that lead to this Artistic device, they make it possible for the audience to perceive time as the Duration.

**Keywords:** *Artistic device, Bergson, Bela Tarr, Duration, Image.*

## Introduction

According to Bergson, a little look at the question of time is the result of ignoring the distinction between two types of Plurality; Plurality of objective matters

such as objects and plurality of mental states which is a concrete thing. In his opinion, without considering this distinction, when we talk about time in relation to psychological and conscientious matters, we have

\*This article is an extract from Ph.D. thesis of "Mohammad Reza Faqih Habibi" entitled "Narration of the Formal Elements of Cinematography from Bergson's Duration Theory: The Case Study on Bresson's, Béla Tarr's and Kiarostami's Works" that under the supervision of Dr. "Ali

Sheikh Mehdi" and the advisement of Dr. "Maryam Bakhtiarian" at Law, Theology and Political Sciences, Azad University, Science and Research Unit. Tehran. Iran.

\*\* Corresponding author: +989124362981, Ali.sheikhmehdi@modares.ac.ir.

turned time into space. However, mental and emotional affairs constantly affect each other and can't be counted, separated, and divided like quantitative pluralities. For this reason, this separation has created a big confusion in the history of philosophy from Zeno to the present day. In fact, mental affairs merge into each other and the past, present, and future do not have separable points. The past is constantly becoming present and they become one with the future without stopping.

This view of Bergson is presented below with an emphasis on Deleuze's interpretation of Duration. The reason for this choice is Deleuze's perception of the moving image that is in the essence of cinema, as the right way to face the world in the present age. For Deleuze, the history of cinema is not a mere human product, but rather reflects the way of facing the world and refers to the way of thinking in that era. First of all, Deleuze was aware of the potential of Bergson's Duration and the nature of cinema for the existence of affinity between them, and she wrote two books, "Cinema 1" and "Cinema 2" in this direction, which are considered the main source in this field.

Deleuze et al. (2011) tried to show the dependence of the cinematic image on our understanding of time in the book "Perception, Time and Cinema", which is considered an explanation of Deleuze's two books. Also, Fath Taheri & Parsa (2016) in an article titled "Time and Cinema A Study of the Philosophy of Henri Bergson on Gilles Deleuze's Philosophy of Cinema", as well as Manteghi Fasayi & Bani Ardalan (2013) in "Bergson: Infrastructure of Deleuze Cinematic Philosophy", have explained the complete dependence of Deleuze's theory on Bergson Duration. Along with Deleuze, they show that movement in cinema is not something imposed from outside but is intrinsic to the cinema so that in Deleuze's image-time we witness a transcendental analysis of the real object.

Also, Nadezadeh Govaresaki et al. (2021) in their article entitled "The concept of virtual image in the philosophy of Gilles Deleuze and its influence on the European art cinema movement", as a case study work on the Hiroshima, Mon Amour, Last Year at Marienbad and Eternal. Also, Sarbakhsh & Sarbakhsh (2024) in their article entitled "Examining the Idea of Time based on the Opinions of Gilles Deleuze in the Iranian Cinema of the

90s (with Case Analysis of Movies: Fish and Cat, Enter the Dragon! and The Ridiculous)", they have asked to follow Bergson's steps in foreign and Iranian cinematographic works. The following in both of these articles is based on non-formal and content elements. Elements such as the stream of consciousness, the simultaneity of past, present, and future, nonlinear narrative, making atmosphere between reality and fantasy, The subjectiveness of shots, flash-back, and flash-forward. Although some of them, like the last three cases, can also be considered formal elements, they have addressed the narrative potential to show the narration of Bergson's Duration in these films. Unlike this article, which emphasizes the formal elements and Epoche the narrative and content elements, it seeks the cinematic formal elements to show the narration of Bergson's Duration.

## Duration

### • The relationship between consciousness and duration<sup>1</sup>

Deleuze, in contrast to Kant, who considered time and space to be the valves of understanding, agrees with Bergson. Although Bergson accepts that we understand the world through its combination with time and space, and also accepts that they are tied to our perception; it is not like we can't take a step back and intuit how this combination is (Pearson & Mullarkey, 2011). Therefore, Bergson's efforts in explaining Duration's theory should not be regarded as an effort in epistemology; Bergson seems to be reviewing Kant's third critique. This means that Bergson does not seek to expand human understanding, but expands our intuition of human states, which Kant also discussed in the third critique.

Bergson also criticizes reason in the Cartesian sense because he believes that this reason creates stability. Reason produces something that we can consider very similar to photographic images. Static images of things whose reality is in flux (Fath Taheri & Parsa, 2016). Science only records synchronicities and has nothing to do with what happens in the distance. Science can increase the ends and reduce the distance, But the distance itself escapes from science. Thus, science only reaches space, and it is easy to understand why space has replaced time and is still called

time. Because our consciousness is there. Consciousness brings dynamic time into time that is frozen in space. By translating mathematical time, our mind re-marks the path it has taken to reach it (Pearson & Mullarkey, 2011). Our self thinks, makes decisions, gets excited, and goes out of its normal state, and these states penetrate each other, as soon as we assume them in space, a new state is established on the self; Because this self is involved with the common sense and has created our real self, it divides our superficial life into external (spatial) parts; Because by habit, the indivisible flow of our consciousness is defined in divisible parts. Similarly, our feelings are distinguished from each other, as are the external causes of their creation. We are usually convinced that the shadow of the self is thrown in the homological space because the desire for consciousness is always dialyzing; Therefore, they are divided into parts and the symbol takes the place of Duration or is understood through it (Bergson, 1975).

Our desire to present a clear picture of the externality of everything originates from our desire for social life. If there was no social life, this desire would still exist, but like animals. Hence, animals have the distinction of objects, but with a great difference compared to the distinction that we have from the images of objects; Therefore, a secondary self is formed, which makes the original self disappear. It creates the self that takes advantage of congruent and separated moments and is easily expressed in words (*ibid.*). It should be noted that the more attention to the qualitative difference between two points on a level, it creates the more mental activity, and on the contrary, the more emphasis on their quantitative and continuous homogeneity, it creates the less mental activity (Pearson & Mullarkey, 2011). So we must distinguish two kinds of plurality, two completely different ways of considering the Duration, two aspects of conscious life. First, a detailed psychological analysis under the homogeneity that is the symbol of the true Duration, and on the other hand, the Duration whose heterogeneous moments intermingle.

Our perception is a kind of image. However, the image of the object is framed. This image depicts part of the object. Thus, this special image is nothing but the object, but not the whole object either. We record part of the action of the object and then the reaction to it as perception, and this perception

includes things that are beneficial for us or functions that are in line with our needs. According to Bergson and Deleuze, human consciousness is only an interval among other images. Such a break occurs between cinematic images: a gap between action and reaction (Asgari, 2017).

#### • The meaning and place of the image in Deleuze's view

According to Deleuze, movement in the first half of the history of cinema is the essence of cinema. Cinema does not encounter the observer with an image to which motion is added, but in Deleuze's interpretation, cinema offers the movement-image independently and directly. Even the cut between two shots is a part of the image and allows the eye to perceive the effect of the movement. Deleuze's book *Cinema 1* is an ontological description of the classical period and the centrality of the role of movement in the history of cinema. A period that, at the end of it and for the reasons described by Deleuze, suffers a crisis and sets the stage for the second period, which is the centrality of time means the modern cinema (Deleuze, 2022).

Deleuze states that there is nothing behind the image. The image itself is independent of itself and not independent of an object or a subject. That's why Bergson has gone beyond idealism and realism with the concept of image and left behind the duality of matter and soul. Phenomenological material should not be considered mental material in contrast to objective material because, with phenomenological reduction, there is nothing left to distinguish between subjective and objective. In this way, the perceived image is reduced to what is directly given. Deleuze says in *Cinema 2* that the movement-image. A movement-image is neither a moving image nor an image that moves, but an image that itself is movement (Mashayekhi & Azmoudeh, 2013).

In *Cinema 1*, Deleuze analyzes three types of movement-images. Perception-image, action-image and affection-image. These three are not the same genus with different differentia, but they have a genetic relationship with each other, and that movement image is their mother. Movement-images, when they are connected with a specific image, cause three types of images: perception-image, action-image, and affection-image. Our consciousness is nothing but the combination of these three images, whether we are a special image or an accidental image (Deleuze, 2022).

The film cannot be made from one type of these images, which is why editing means the combination of these images. In reality, editing is putting together the perception images, the action images, and the affection images. However, in any film, some may prevail over others, and three types of editing, i.e., perceptual editing, action editing, and affective editing emerge from it. Griffith adopted action edit and Dreyer adopted affective edit. Vertov is the perfect example of perceptual editing. These three types of edit can be attributed to three types of framing. The close-up is related to the affective-image, the medium shot to the action-image, and long shots are considered a type of perception-image (ibid.).

#### • Time-image

In Cinema 2, Deleuze mentions Ozo as a great critic of everyday life, who reveals the unbearable in the heart of the senseless and makes the viewer think. Characters in modern movies are not pragmatic. They are indifferent passersby who do not care about anything in the world around them. But Deleuze insists not to confuse this crazy look with the tourist look. These characters have been affected by something unbearable. When the foundation of sensory-motivative fails, another type of image emerges. A pure light-sound image that reveals the object itself apart from any metaphorical and clichéd function and the viewer is exposed to the influx of excess beauty or fear of the object in itself. Both modern cinema and classical cinema are considered narrators of Duration, classical cinema indirectly and by depicting the image of movement, and modern cinema directly and by depicting the image of time (Manteghi Fasayi & Bani Ardalan, 2013).

Deleuze states that Bergson's attempt to bridge the gap between subject and object is similar to the effort of phenomenologists such as Husserl who emphasize that consciousness is always consciousness of something. Object and Subject form an inseparable unit. Of course, phenomenologists start their work by assuming consciousness; But Bergson starts from the pervasive flow of matter-image and then infers consciousness as a special type of image (Deleuze et al., 2011).

What distinguishes the time image from the movement-image is the beginning of the recording of the images in memory. Time-image results from the exchange between

real images and images that are present in the memory in virtual form. Bergson mentions two types of memory in his book, Matter and Memory:

1. A pure memory that preserves the events with its history, that the sequence of these events is the same as the sequence of events in mind. This memory is mental and has no place in the body.
2. A memory that is tied to our habits and is in the present moment. Such memory is truly related to our perception-sensation and is usually the result of some kind of practice in that subject, like memorizing a poem after practicing and repeating it several times (Bergson, 1975).

Therefore, for Bergson, thought takes place when it actualizes its pure memory in perception-sensation and creates an image (Manteghi Fasayi & Bani Ardalan, 2013). Time-image, which is the result of shortening the circuits between real images and images that are formed in memory, did not arise in the brain or mind. These circuits are shortened so much that the border between the images in the memory and the real images is dimmed or removed (Deleuze, 2000).

Another type of time-image can be found in Bergson's works under the title of coexistence of time, which he mentions in the book "Matter and Memory". He believed in the coexistence of past, present, and future. This coexistence of times in Bergson brings us closer to the purest image of Duration, and according to Deleuze's description, it creates two types of time images: 1. Mirror-image 2. Crystal-image.

In the mirror image, we are faced with only one real image and its reflection, the border between the past and the present has disappeared. But in the crystal image, we have a multifaceted mirror in front of us that endlessly reflects the image All refer to this current image. Here, like a mirror image, the separation of present, past, and future is not clear from each other.

This is how Deleuze talks about two types of time-images:

1. Audio-visual image: This image was the result of the inefficiency of the sensory-motor structure in classical cinema in the narration of time. The cinema of observation replaces the cinema of action, and editing will no longer be the result of a certain rhythm and sequence between the shots, and the time-image is not the result of this sequence,

but the result of the tempo within the shot itself. Edit in this cinema does not seek to answer the question of why the shots are sequenced, but it answers the question of what is being depicted.

2. Dream-image: the images that go back and forth between the dream and the present moment without demarcation between reality and dream (*ibid.*) Lynch's cinema can show us a tangible form of this excursion.

#### • The feature of consciousness during the duration of perceiving

From the previous explanations, the following feature can be listed for the Duration perceiver, which we will use as a tool to measure the relationship of the formal elements of Bela Tarr's cinema which is given in [Table 1](#).

It can be described as follows: when our view of time is not epistemological in the Kantian sense (in Kant, time is quantitative and the gateway to the epistemology) and at the same time we need the consciousness of the subject to understand the ontological aspect, now, we can step into the experience of Duration and its understanding. Thus, consciousness is an observer of its states that accumulate and penetrate each other, and at every moment, consciousness is fattened from within, and this fattening leads to mental activity; Because consciousness is constantly growing. One of the results of this is the difference of each moment from the previous and subsequent moments; Because the Duration is nothing but the accumulation of internal states, and such a subject can experience the Duration.

#### • What is the artistic device?

Artistic devices are very important in the eyes of Russian formalists, and it is basically what makes art, art. This same position in the eyes of formalists shows that art is inherently related to form. Artistic device is everything that makes our narrative form appear novel and innovative. It means either to show us a new form or to offer a used thing in a new form. This is not limited to any element in the artistic medium. In poetry, the use of rhymes and radif and different metrics, or Metaphors, Ambiguity, Similes, and Iham, are all tools that can shape the artwork.

By using the word novel in the definition of Artistic device, we understand that Artistic device is dependent on the audience's mind; Because something may be novel

for one person and not novel for another. This itself has another requirement. The fact that it is an Artistic device is relative. That is, an Artistic device can be active and innovative for one person and inactive for another person; in terms of geography or culture, a certain Artistic device is not novel and is considered to be very repetitive. The Artistic device is the thing that causes De-familiarization. This means, something is completely familiar and repetitive for the audience due to the creative use of the Artistic device by the artist, or the combination of the Artistic devices released from the previous decay and made to appear novel ([Shafi'i Kodkani, 2012](#)).

It should be pointed out that these artistic devices in cinema, which do not use words like literature, are formed through non-structural formal elements. Thus, we search for these artistic devices not separately, but in the heart of non-structural formal elements. That is, to enumerate the artistic devices that are considered structural as formal elements and show how we have reached these Artistic devices and structural form elements in Bela Tarr's cinema from non-structural elements. Then we show that all these elements, including formal structural, and non-structural, provide a platform for Consciousness that can reach the understanding of Duration through Bela Tarr's cinematic works.

#### • Structural formal elements (Artistic devices) of Bela Tarr's cinema

##### - Boredom

Boredom due to the use of long take, the choice of black and white colors, and of course, the selection of themes and adaptation works that have this potential, and the design of a scene full of barren lands and half-ruined houses, wind and storm, the decaying world and human beings who are deformed and devoid of feelings and lost in emptiness ([Jahed, 2016](#)) with the high contrast that increases the bitterness of this boredom, boredom can be considered as the main Artistic device of Bela Tarr's cinema. Bela Tarr: "Time is empty, the indivisible and eternal dimension in which everything repeats itself in the same way" (*ibid.*).

##### - Naturalism

Naturalism can be seen through the use of nature and the existence of man in the control of nature and its violence in Bela Tarr's works. In all of Bela Tarr's works, wind,

Table 1. Duration Components. Source: Authors.

Duration Components Types	Sub-Components
Positive	qualitative
	Constant creation(Each moment is different from the other)
	Overlap of mental states
	internal expansion
	The inseparability of mental states
	Ontological aspect
Negative	qualitative
	not qualitative
	Moments are not the same
	Not mixing space and time
	External expansion
	Separability of mental states
	Epistemological aspect
Unconscious mental activity	

rain, and storm show the nature that causes man to get involved in boredom. The boredom is that they are trapped tragically and inevitably.

**- Contrast**

The contrast in Bela Tarr’s works shows itself mostly in the theme. For example, in “Werckmeister Harmonies”, when Yanush is performing a performance in a pub with all the numbness that is scattered in the pub space, his attempt to create a ray of hope is only frustrated during the film. Or in “The Turin Horse”, which more intelligently ridicules Nietzsche’s entire philosophical system, when at the end of the initial narration of the film, Nietzsche says to his mother, “I am a fool” and also in the continuation of the film, we watch the human suffering and the crystallization of Schopenhauer’s idea that in contrast with Nietzsche’s idea.

Distancing effect: Bela Tarr’s Distancing effect is not of Bresson’s type, which is mainly based on the actor’s mechanical play, but by exaggerating the time of the shot, which we can observe in all his works.

**• Non-structural formal elements of Bela Tarr’s cinema**

**- Acting**

It is meaningless for Bela Tarr to have an actor or a non-actor. He has used professional actors, non-actors, and even famous American actors (Taheri & Karimi, 2015) What matters to Bela Tarr is not necessarily Bresson’s mechanical play, nor the conventional play of commercial cinema. He is looking for a type of acting that best defines

the boredom he is looking for. Therefore, the play of Bela Tarr’s films is so internal that its reference to the psychological aspects of the character is not correct except in a few cases. Bela Tarr learned from Bresson that the play that represents the psychological aspects of the character brings us closer to the dramatic narrative and brings cinema to the lap of theater and literature. This closeness requires moving away from cinema as an observation that Bela Tarr is looking for. However, Bella Tarr is not looking for Bresson’s mechanical acting; Because he does not feel compelled to build a foundation for the cinematography like Robert Bresson.

In the works of Bela Tarr, which sometimes refer to the psychological aspects of the characters, we still see an epistemological state. For example, when Yanush talks to a man wearing a woolen coat in the middle of the city square in the film “Werckmeister Harmonie” or in “Satan’s Tango”, where people are between hope and despair, we watch the psychological state. But it should be noted that these situations show themselves as behaviors based on our awareness and not the attack of a psychological complex and as a result inevitable psychological pressure, like the narratives in commercial cinema that are one of these requirements for characterization.

**- Shot size**

In Bela Tarr’s long take, which includes special camera movements, the views change from long shot and full shot to medium shot and close-up and vice versa during one shot. In fact, the shot size function is the same as the

classical function, with the difference that it is formed without interruption. Bela Tarr's camera moves slowly to get from one shot to the next and somehow he prepares audiences for it.

He started his formal style from the movie «Macbeth». The 5-minute long take before the title sequence and the 67-minute long take after that make up the entire film. His visual sensibilities moved from imperfect close-ups to abstract mediums and long shots (Rancière, 2015). For Bela Tarr, it was important for the perspective of the characters to be close to the narrator, because, in many scenes, the perspective of the camera was not instead of the character, but close to the character. Where Karrer is watching the house in «Damnation» is an example of this kind of perspective. It is from this point of view that the medium and close-up become important for Bella Tarr as well. Of course, like Bresson, he was also aware of the role of eye projection in close-up.

#### - Camera height and angle

Bela Tarr's long takes fluidize the frame both in terms of height and camera angle. At the same time, the angle is more important for him than the height of the camera. The 90-degree angle is one of Bela Tarr's favorite angles, especially in the shots where he tries to give a hint of what the character is seeing in this angle. For example, in the movie «The Man from London», in the fourth shot of the film, where Maloin is watching a man and a woman get into a car in a long shot, and after the car leaves, Malone himself enters the same frame and disappears in the long shot. The scene in the movie Curse where the camera rotates around the woman in the café. All these cases show the playfulness that Bela Tarr does with the angle and sometimes with the height of the camera in his camera movements, which undoubtedly shows the audience a change of perspective in a metaphorical way.

#### - Color and light

In Bela Tarr's cinema, we only see the use of color in the Macbeth telefilm, «The Prefab People». The rest of his works are black and white. In Bela Tarr's opinion, almost no color can represent the boredom desired by Bela Tarr more than the combination of black and white. Darkness is also always waiting to swallow the character in Bela Tarr's works and give it back to the light, to

swallow it again and give it back. We see this game in «Werckmeister Harmonies», The Man from London, and even Damnation. Bela Tarr's boredom shows himself from the beginning to the end in films such as Turin Horse and sometimes during Endless Hopes such as Satan's Tango, Werckmeister Harmonies, Damnation, and The Man from London. Therefore, playing with light is used more than Turin Horse in these works. In most of his works, Bela Tarr's black and white images are a kind of timeless induction, along with the selection of deserted cities and villages, creating an intangible time and place.

#### - Camera movement

In Bela Tarr, since the realization of boredom occurs through long takes, the importance of camera movement is clear. The camera movements are designed based on the long mise-en-scenes of Bela Tarr. The director's foundation is that the camera does not leave the character as much as possible because a moment of the situation should not be lost. Also, the atmosphere inside the shot should draw its own extension in the human condition and the camera should not get tired of understanding the human condition. Therefore, the camera, since it should be the narrator of this situation, willingly tolerates the movement. By moving his camera, he matches moral virtues with cinematographic virtues (ibid.).

#### - Scene design

In Bela Tarr, the selection of specific locations is in the early stages of filmmaking. Bela Tarr's interior spaces bear the same share the boredom and infelicitous of human life. In Bela Tarr's works, the city is like a city plagued by plague or a city that is plagued by leprosy. Let's remember Werckmeister Harmonies, that huge whale in the middle of the square is so involved in neglect that the logic of such a show in the center of the city is in doubt. First, the actors and then the scene design, which should remind us of boredom.

#### - Out of frame

The stretching of the shot in Bela Tarr brings another protraction besides the shot itself. The meaning of this visual protraction is that Bela Tarr does not need to use the sound frame to emphasize the outside of the frame to keep the audience's mind in the shot. For example, the beginning sequence of Satan's Tango and the scene of the

cows leaving the barn and the movement of the cows and accompanying them on the mud rural path still keep the audience's mind in the scene of trying to mate the bull in that herd of cows. Even the mind sometimes goes beyond the scene and leads to the possible location they are going to reach. The best example of *mise-en-scène* based on the outside of the frame in Bela Tarr's works is the scene in *The Turin Horse* where the man and the girl with their cart go up to the hill and go down from it, and the frame is still waiting. They return to the hill and return to their home, and the camera stays on this side of the hill all this time.

#### - *Mise-en-scenes*

Unlike Bresson, it is Bela Tarr who is a master of long *mise-en-scenes*. We must not forget that cinematic necessity is something that, apart from Bresson, who is the initiator of the cinematographic movement, has also challenged Bela Tarr of course, not as the main artistic device. But since he is interested in the flow of cinematography, he uses it. Bresson was looking for *Ijaz* as the main goal of creating his work, and Bela Tarr sees *Ijaz* as merely showing boredom. *Ijaz* does not want to limit us; Rather, it wants to show us that a cinematic work is self-sufficient and does not need anything outside of itself to attract the audience. What we see in *Satan's Tango* is pure cinema and does not need storytelling, emotional feeling, quick editing, etc. to deceive the audience's mind. This is cinema, just like "Ten" of Kiarostami and "Mouchette" of Bresson (Pipolo, 2010). All of these works are remarkably appropriate to the purpose of their authors, who are aware of the potential within the medium of cinema, and have cinematic necessity; Of course, with the extra emphasis that Bresson needs in this.

Therefore, even though Bela Tarr's *mise-en-scenes* are more complex, they are still only narrators of boredom and in this sense they are *Ijaz*. That is, there was no way to show this type of boredom except by using this type of *mise-en-scène* and long takes, and no medium like cinema could narrate this boredom with this power.

#### - Edit

Tempo is important in the editing of Bela Tarr's works. The energy within the frame is the result of the actors' play and the calm movement of the camera among the actors and the scene design. This tempo increases with

the wind and rain and the use of black and white color and makes us disappointed by any rhythm resulting from editing and arranging the images together. Although we can follow this rhythm in Bresson's works, Bresson does not follow it by adding the length of the shot and long camera movements.

#### - Sound frame

In Bela Tarr's works, silence replaces poetic and philosophical dialogues, and this event reaches its peak in *A Man from London* and *The Turin Horse* (Jahed, 2016). He uses the asynchrony and imperceptibility of sound and image Like Tarkovsky and Sokurov. In the opening sequence of *Satan's Tango*, the sound of cows is mixed with the sound of church bells. In the following, we find out that there is no source for that because the nearest city is far away and the tower of the nearby church was also destroyed in the Second World War. These contrasts add a surreal feeling to the work (*ibid.*). Due to the silence in the dialogues or machine-gun monologues, Bela Tarr still insists on his intended boredom and does not seek to create another world through the sound frame.

#### Conclusion

Due to the elimination of dramatic elements, Bela Tarr's cinema provides at least a suitable space for the presence of the audience's self-consciousness and as a result the experience of Duration, and at the same time, through the minimalism in his cinema, the emotional aspect of the cinema audience is clear and distinct and maximized. He does this by eliminating the psychological effects on the mind of the audience as much as possible. Thus, Bela Tarr's cinema can be the best path for Bergson's Duration narrative, which first of all, as the gateway, requires the self-consciousness of the audience and provides the right space to transform the audience into a mere observer.

Now, it is necessary to check to what extent these formal elements by themselves and apart from the theme and the text, can narrate the time that exists in the film in such a way as to establish an understanding of Duration.

Among the formal and structural elements, apart from the weakening of the dramatic structure in Bela Tarr's cinema, which was considered as the basis for the possibility of Duration narrative, and minimalism, which expanded

this possibility, we should go to other artistic devices. We start with Ijaz. Just as minimalism adds to the clarity of the subjective aspect of the subject of identification that intends to understand the Duration, Ijaz also adds to this clarity. But on the condition that the object being narrated is Duration itself. Also, Naturalism, Repetition, Metaphor, and Contrast, can increase the clarity of these intentions; But the mere existence of these Artistic devices, apart from the object being narrated, is not a guarantee of the audience's attention to Bergson's Duration<sup>2</sup>.

Among the non-structural formal elements, the long take is the most important element for Duration understanding. This influence can be followed in different ways. The effect that the long take has on the use of the shot size and the distance of transition from one shot to another is the same as Duration understanding that it removes the distance between two mental states and accumulation takes place. On the other hand, it is the effect that long takes have on the camera angle and makes it fluid. This flow of angles causes the change of narrative perspective to be formed without distance, and we observe this change from the moment of beginning to completion unlike the change of angle due to edit. This elimination of distances is closely related to Bergson's Duration theory. This is achieved by the movement of the camera in the long take and not only by the long take alone. In filmmakers like Haneke or Kiarostami, we also have long takes that lack movement and do not change perspective, or they make it through editing. The long Take is also influential on the understanding of Duration in another way. Boredom and its connection with Duration will be mentioned below.

In Bela Tarr's boredom, the audience sees futility. What does this futility have to do with, especially with the presence of the formal elements of Bela Tarr's cinema, such as the long take? Living and being. Being is nothing but the passing of time on human existence. Boredom is an Artistic device that affects the quality of the measured time. Because boredom is nothing but understanding moments in which meaning is missing. As a result, Bela Tarr's boredom is a Bergson Duration narrator using his non-structural formal elements.

It may be criticized that boredom is a content discussion and the basis of the article is the investigation of narration

through formal elements. In response, we must say that Bela Tarr creates this boredom regardless of the content of the work and only depicts this boredom with his formal elements. Long takes along with the scene design and the light and color that he chooses as well as the camera movements and changing the size of the shots during a long and slow take of these movements and the acting of the actors are all formal elements that make even the most exciting screenplay boring. Long takes drag out time, and late cuts provide more time for the subjects' reflection, and also create boredom for the audience, attention to the issue of time and narrates Bergson Duration. We should not forget that, as Rancière points out, in Bela Tarr, form is nothing but the establishment of space and time (Rancière, 2015) and all non-structural formal elements in Bela Tarr's cinema seek to stabilize it.

In short, the elimination of dramatic structure and minimalism are considered to be the foundational formal elements of Duration understanding. Ijaz, metaphor, contrast, repetition, and even ambiguity will help to understand Duration if there is a content relationship of the object being narrated. Boredom which is a specific Artistic device to Bela Tarr's cinema, is characterized by non-structural elements such as long takes, using camera movement and its effects on angles, heights, and mise-en-scenes without editing, as well as scene design, contrast, black and white color selection for film and acting type of actors. It is the only Artistic device that narrates Bergson's Duration independent of the object being narrated and the content of the work.

The authors declare that there was no conflict of interest for them in conducting this research.

## Endnotes

1. Pasolini rightly reminds us that we reach the purest form in the cinema, which is beyond the objective and subjective. Cinema is a self-ritual vision that presents content. We are caught in the correlation between the perception-images and the awareness of the camera. If you are looking for an answer, we must say that according to Pasolini, we are facing a semi-subjective picture. In fact, we do not see any instability. This is a kind of stillness corresponding to a higher aesthetic form (Deleuze, 2022)/ 2. Ambiguity as an Artistic device, unlike contrast, reduces this clarity, but increases the mental activity of the audience. So, from this point of view, it can still play a role of helping to understand Duration. But it does not directly affect the understanding of Duration. We are not looking for remarkable mental states; Because apart from ambiguity, fear may also change the quality of moments, and as a result, horror genre films are considered suitable films for Duration narration, which We know that it is not so.; Because in situations like fear or uncertainty, we do not have the necessary self-consciousness to understand the Duration. Let us raise an issue. Didn't Bergson's Duration change the quantitative

perception of time to qualitative? Didn't Bergson want to make us aware of the psychological thing? Don't dramatic works depict the best and most psychological state of the characters? So why, for example, horror movies are not talked about as movies with high power for narration from the Duration?

We must note that we should not confuse mental affairs with states of consciousness. Duration understanding is not through the occurrence of psychological things, but through self-consciousness of the occurrence of psychological things that happen to us one by one. Therefore, merely showing the occurrence of psychological issues for the character seen in dramatic films does not help to realize Duration; Rather, the possibility of the existence of self-consciousness while watching a film in the first step can provide the possibility of realizing the Duration, and then the audience should understand this psychological accumulation while being self-conscious of the issue of Duration. In fact, Duration is self-consciousness of the observation of the mental matter by the subject and not the mental matter itself. Duration is the situation in the subject who has passed mental states and considers and observes those states as an open and infinite whole. Thus, Duration is the self-consciousness that escapes from the psychological and reaches the state of observation, which is considered a necessary condition for Duration understanding.

## References List

- Asgari, S. (2017). *Negah-e Gilles Deleuze Be Cinema dar Gharn-e Bistom* [Gilles Deleuze's view of cinema in the 20th century]. Ferdosi, (67-68). [in Persian].
- Bergson, H. (1975). *Time and free will* (A. Saadat Nejad, Trans.). Amir Kabir. (Original work published 1910).
- Deleuze, G. (2000). *Cinema 2, The Time-image* (H. Tomlinson, & B. Habberjam, Trans.). University of Minnesota Press.
- Deleuze, G., Colebrook, C., & Bogue, R. (2011). *Perception, time and cinema* (M. Parsa, Trans.). Rokhdadnoo. (Original work published 2002).
- Deleuze, G. (2022). *Cinema 1, movement-image* (M. Islami, Trans.). Gilgamesh. (Original work published 1983).
- Fath Taheri, A., & Parsa, M. (2016). Being, Time and Cinema A Study of the Philosophy of Henri Bergson on Gilles Deleuze's Philosophy of Cinema. *Journal of Fine Arts: Performing Arts & Music*, 21(1), 35-50. <https://doi.org/10.22059/jfadram.2016.57672>
- Jahed, P. (2016). *The gloomy world of bela tarr. Ijaz*. (Original work published 1955).
- Manteghi Fasayi, Z. G., & Bani Ardalan, E. (2013). Bergson: Infrastructure of Deleuze Cinematic Philosophy. *Journal of Dramatic Arts and Music*, 3(6), 47-63. <https://doi.org/10.30480/dam.2013.60>
- Mashayekhi, A., & Azmoudeh, M. (2013). *Deleuze Ide Zaman* (Goftogu-ee darbare-ye Deleuze) [Deleuze's idea of time (a conversation about Gilles Deleuze)]. Bidgol. [in Persian].
- Nadezadeh Govaresaki, M., Moradkhani, A., & Afshar, H. (2021). Mafhoum-e Tasveer-e Majazi da Falsafeye Gill Deleuze va Tasir an bar jonbesh cinam-ee Honari-e Oropa [The concept of virtual image in the philosophy of Gilles Deleuze and its influence on the European art cinema movement]. *Gharb shenasi-ye bonyadi*, 13(2), 187-213. [in Persian]. <https://doi.org/10.30465/os.2023.45635.1913>
- Pearson, K. A., & Mullarkey, J. (2011). *Bergson's philosophy* (M. Pir Moradi Trans.). Side. (Original work published 2002).
- Pipolo, T. (2010). *Robert Bresson: A Passion for Film*. Oxford University Press.
- Rancière, J. (2015). *Béla Tarr, le temps d'après* (M. Sheikhi, Trans.). Shurafarin. (Original work published 2013).
- Shafi'i Kodkani, M. R. (2012). *Rastakhiz Kalamat: Dars Gofar ha-e Darbar-e Nazari-y Adabi-e Sooratgaran-e Russ* [The Resurrection of Words: Lectures on the Literary Theory of Russian Formalists]. Sokhan. [in Persian].
- Sarbakhsh, R., & Sarbakhsh, R. (2024). Examining the Idea of Time based on the Opinions of Gilles Deleuze in the Iranian Cinema of the 90s (with Case Analysis of Movies: Fish and Cat, Enter the Dragon! and The Ridiculous). *Wisdom and Philosophy*, 19(74), 119-145. <https://doi.org/10.22054/wph.2023.56156.1912>
- Taheri, S., & Karimi, B. (2015). *Bela Tarr Be Revayat-e Bela Tarr va Hamkaran* (M. Sheikhi, A. Foorootan, & E. Dehghan, Trans.). Shurafarin.

### COPYRIGHTS

Copyright for this article is retained by the author(s), with publication rights granted to the Bagh-e Nazar Journal. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution License (<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).



### HOW TO CITE THIS ARTICLE

Faqih Habibi, M. R., Sheikh Mehdi, A., & Bakhtiarian, M. (2025). A Narration of Bergson's Duration by Formal Elements of Bela Tarr's Cinema. *Bagh-e Nazar*, 21(139), 47-56.

DOI: 10.22034/BAGH.2024.461112.5629

URL: [https://www.bagh-sj.com/article\\_209507.html?lang=en](https://www.bagh-sj.com/article_209507.html?lang=en)

